

# Der GARTENBAHN *profi*

2 / 2006

[www.gartenbahnprofi.de](http://www.gartenbahnprofi.de)

INTERNATIONALES MAGAZIN FÜR GROSSE MODELLBAHNEN

© 2006 GARTENBAHNprofi  
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

Translated by: Hans-Joerg Mueller

If you require additional information regarding the English version of the *GARTENBAHNprofi*  
please contact Eastern Mountain Models Ltd.  
[sales@easternmountainmodels.com](mailto:sales@easternmountainmodels.com) or phone: 250-558-1867 or FAX: 250-558-6186

## Pre-View Copy

Editorial

### Welcome Page 3

.....to this edition, which is mostly about new items: Some that were just delivered to the dealers and others that were just announced - Nürnberg, the location of the annual toy fair during February, had a few surprises to fill our briefcases.

The biggest: PIKO will expand participation in the Large Scale orchestra from playing in the "Accessories" section to also setting new notes in the "Rolling Stock" section. The Sonneberg producer, a former OEM producer for LGB, presented the modern DB Taurus engine as a first enticement for prospective customers. Just like with LGB's 101, this is a Standard Gauge item that finds its way onto the Narrow Gauge track and this at a very attractive ca. E200

Dr. Wilfer brought two samples of the engine to the show - one of which had already run approx. thirty test miles. Those tests along with a very competitive price certainly gave Dr. Wilfer a reason to smile at the NTF. During a conversation with GARTENBAHNprofi he mentioned "I want to give Large Scalers a reason to smile again." Sounds like a challenge.....

The mood in the "G" producers' camp was at least in part "G"rumpy. Talk of a unified "concert" would be totally

misplaced, since Brawa lifted the veil on their secret "Project G4/5" a year ago. The Swabians, who presented additional new rolling stock like the RhB MoW Xk 9039, had the chance on the second day of the NTF to be "confronted" with a LGB-surprise model. The Franconians presented an oxide-coloured C 2012 relettered as a MoW car and signaled: We are producing that, too! And even in two versions! That the information at the fair regarding the model - not listed among the NEW items - consisted of a photocopied B&W flyer, indicated to us a mighty hurry. Just like the fact that the display sample had no tooling changes: windows and interior precisely like the stock C2012.

Details like these are duly noted within the industry, but they weren't really important. It was more like waving the flag - and a real sample is always more than just a picture in the display unit; LGB had quite a few of those. For good reason: the samples were more important to the progress of production preparation than they were as information for the dealers or journalists. In any case we expect the Franconians, who intend to shine at their big bash in Juli, will present additional important new items, among them the DB V200. Our testing tracks will not lie idle.

In that regard: Our typical test/review of 3 to 4 pages, takes a solid week of work. Picture taking, test running, measuring, appraising, writing, debating - and then still more contemplating and double checking, all in order to for you to recognize if the item suits your requirements. We certainly don't test the quality of a product by throwing it through the open window, to then go and check in the garden if there are more pieces than just the wheelsets lying around. But one garden railroader attested with this method in a letter to the editor of the manufacturer's magazine high product quality. Yep! The delight with the "like new" condition of the Airborn-Cars closes with: "Would other G manufacturers with this kind of flight test....." Yes, what's the point? We don't throw the test pieces, we'd rather run them when nit comes to do reviews.

It is a good thing, that there are additional manufacturers, who also have different product philosophies - some for the smaller and others for the bigger cheque book.

fw & gil / HJM

## 1000hp for switching chores Page 19

When Large Scale manufacturers offer many colour schemes, compromises are the result. The review sample of the CP version has certainly the least in common with the prototype. However, painted and lettered for a different railway the new switcher can certainly be recommended.

Only detailed, painstaking research on the Internet and in our own library divulged that Canadian Pacific - as of late our favourite railway - had only a few S-4. Almost identical engines were produced by MLW and saw service as S-3. Engine 6591 (an S-3) left the factory in July of 1957, with the number boards mounted on the front ends, not on the side like the previous series. CP engine 6525 would have made a better prototype.

The S-3, otherwise identical with the S-4, had narrower grille openings and an additional door on the hood. The exhaust stack was more rounded, the side cab windows were not divided and quite often a three chime horn was mounted underneath the cab roof overhang.

Those are the mistakes the CP fan needs to contend with - along with the incorrect ALCO builders plate, since the engine was built by MLW. The Canadian National (CN) had also S-4 on the roster. However those who would like a prototypical S-4, are better served by buying a USA prototype.

The S-4 is a sister engine of the S-2, the most successful ALCO engine. The S-2 had Blunt trucks. The S-4, of which there were approx. 800 built between 1950 and 1961 had the heavy AAR type A trucks. Both series, including the variants, were powered by a 1000hp six-cylinder diesel.

### DIY railings

Most of the 1:29 model is made of plastic. The handrails and railings are made of brass and painted. The same is true for the pipe that runs on top of the hood, this item is slightly too long and as a result not straight.

The brass railings are included but not installed. Part of the packaging is a styro foam block which can be removed once the railings are installed, thus allowing enough room in the packaging - an excellent solution. The buyer also needs to install the railings on the end platforms. It is

recommended to enlarge the mounting holes just slightly with an awl or as an alternative remove the paint from the end of the railing. The prototype had the stanchions bolted to the sill plates - this optical effect is missing from the model.

The frame and superstructure of the S-4 are well done and feature fine engraving. The rivet heads are slightly too large, but shouldn't really distract. The grille in the hood is prototypically open, the ideal location for a speaker.

The cab has the most prominent features. The two man crew, sporting red ties but no shirts, are seated by the opening windows. Both doors to the cab can be opened. The rear one is held closed by a spring.

The finish and lettering is without fault. However the builders plate is, as mentioned, incorrect and the number boards should be at the front of the hood.

The cab is lit by a LED, the same as in the headlights which unfortunately are governed by a directional circuit. Complete nonsense for a switcher. The number boards are lit.

The smoke generator is very efficient and consumes the smoke fluid sparingly, however the fan is quite loud. There is a shut off when the smoke fluid tank runs dry.

### Nice running on incorrect wheels

The hefty AAR trucks are nicely replicated. However the bearing housings and certainly the brake shoes are too small, the three Phillips-head screws are unsightly. The distance between the outer frame and the upper brace is too large.

An annoyance are the minuscule wheels. The 40" wheels of the prototype scale out to 35 mm for the model. The engine - along with the F3 and a few other of the USA Trains B-truck diesels - rides on 28.2mm wheels. That's a discrepancy of almost 20 %!

The fiberglass reinforced cover plates of the gear boxes ride a scant 1 mm above the rail heads, luckily this didn't affect performance during our test runs, but it makes placing the engine on the track more difficult. Those who don't like the shiny chrome plated wheels can get replacement wheels of the correct size

from NWSL ([www.nwsl.com](http://www.nwsl.com)) in either nickel silver or nickel plated version.

But there are positives to report on the drive: it is silky smooth! When power is interrupted the engine will coast for more than its full length. The axles run in sprung metal bushings mounted in the side frames and are used for power pickup (approx. 1A). Wires lead from the bushings - unfortunately in plain sight - into the frame. The electrical switches for running power, lights and the smoke generator are mounted in the frame. Current is also collected through LGB-like pickups which ride on the rails. Even dirty track will not impede the operation of the smooth running engine.

The pulling power of the engine, which weighs in at 3kg (6.6lbs) is more than sufficient. Sensibly the traction tires have been omitted. LGB couplers are installed and the USA trains plastic couplers are included.

### Almost correct dimensions

Apart from the trucks and the minuscule wheels USA trains produced a very nice 1:29 replica. The length of the frame, the width and the axle distances of the trucks are spot on. The engine is only 1.6mm (.064") too high. Correct measurement are no longer in question on the newer 1:29 models. A clear alternative to not-to-scale products of German manufacturing, more so since USA Trains does not need to hide behind the Nürnberg producer when it comes to finish and running performance - on more than just this engine.

Overall: Sporting the CP livery the S-4 has only rudimentary likeness with the prototype. If one acquires the reasonably priced engine in one of the US railroad liveries, one gets a sturdy model with good running characteristics which represents good value. But one will have to contend with the much undersized wheels, unless one replaces them with the NWSL wheels. USA Trains should finally start to provide the correct wheel sets.

*Friedhelm Weidelich/HJM*

*Captions to pictures and product ratings on next page!*

## Captions:

Page 19 (top) The twins in the cab, both wearing a tie, but no shirt.

Page 19 (bottom) The hefty appearance of the S-4 in CP livery. A nice switcher for the garden. The CN stock car is from the competition - applies to the model, too.

Page 20 (top) The Alco builders plate fits a US engine, but is misplaced on the CP version.

Page 20 (centre)  
The cab door can be opened, the metal railings are sturdy.

Page 20 (bottom)  
The walkway is finely molded but nonetheless solid, as are the grilles. A small distraction: the piping on the left is slightly bent.

Page 21 (top left)  
Excellent top, wanting bottom: the trucks of the USA Trains S-4 are not very well done.

Page 21 (top right)  
The Safety-Tread platform and the metal grab irons are top notch.

Page 21 (centre)  
The trucks and plenty of room for the couplers.

Page 21 (bottom)  
The offending Phillips screw heads and power wires. Luckily the wires don't touch the wheels. Unfortunately the shape of the truck side frames are only an approximation of the prototype.

## USA Trains S-4

### Technical Specifications

Length :	438mm
Length over couplers:	486mm
Largest width:	106mm
Max height above railhead:	154mm
Minimum radius:	600 mm
Weight Engine:	3.0 kg
Draw Bar Pull	10.8N

### Pluses and Minuses

↑	Excellent running quality
↑	Crisp finish and lettering
↑	Good detail
↑	Correct for many US railways
↓	Incorrect type and lettering for CP version
↓	Shiny wheels which are undersize.
↓	Visually wanting trucks
↓	Slightly large rivet detail

## Ratings

USA Trains ALCO S-4 Item# R22563  
Scale: 1:29 Gauge: 45mm

Scale:	●●●●*
Detailing:	●●●●●
Paint and Lettering:	●●●●
Running Gear:	●●●●
Current collection:	●●●●●
Smoke Generator:	●●●●●
Production Quality:	●●●●●
Operation Reliability:	●●●●●
Instruction Manual:	●●●●
Value (Benefit:Price):	●●●●●

Our ratings: ●●●●● is excellent  
● is poor

\*Deductions for wheels and trucks, rest of engine would be six points.

## LGB RhB G 3/4 #11

### The Starlet Page 26

Hard to believe that it took four decades before LGB premiered a steam engine of the worldwide popular Rhaetian Railway. If it is a successful premiere is the subject of this review.

Be it Magnus, Kiss or of late Brawa - other manufacturers took care of the popular RhB steam theme for Large Scale, before LGB discovered it. However the race with Kiss and their announced "Rhätia" (2004), was won by LGB. At the 2005 Nürnberg Fair the "Nürnbergers" announced the G 3/4 #11, which since being a "supporting actress" in the "Heidi" movie of the 50s, also had the nickname "Heidi" - proudly emblazoned on the smoke box door..

The "Rhätia" on the other hand was the first engine of the G 3/4 type, similar in appearance, but shorter and differing in details. Of course the imagination is

already running wild, what metamorphoses the young Heidi could encounter in a long life. This apart from having a colourful past, which should be good for a few livery and lettering variations. But more about that later.

LGB picked a starlet for their first RhB steamer. Back in 1952 "Heidi" had her one and only part in the movie "Heidi", which was based on the novel by Johanna Spyri. So far there have been thirteen versions of "Heidi" on the big screen. The first was a silent movie produced in the USA in 1920, even a animated version was produced in the 1970s in Japan, complete in 52 episodes. In today's terms one could call the human Heidi a "global player".

The prototype engine could also play a large part in the future, if the planned museum line between Davos and Filisur comes on line in 2007. The engine which is

in the care of Club 1889 is presently being overhauled, will be fitted with a new boiler and will in future be oil fired.

LGB on the other hand took the romantic route and builds the Heidi in the coal fired version, last inspection date 23.12.58. This was long after the movie appearance and Heidi was mostly used for switching duties which lasted into the 1970s. This subordinate employ is also the explanation for the brakeman's steps and handrail adjacent to the leading axle. According to the information in the Jeanmaire book "Die Dampflokomotiven der Rhätischen Bahn (Steam engines of the Rhaetian railway)" those steps were installed prior to 1939.

### Detailed but sturdy

LGB went to some length with the

super structure in order to arrive at a fairly authentic replica. With the RhB G 3/4 LGB continues the practice of better detailing without sacrificing the outdoors suitability. Handrails and brake hoses are noticeably finer and made of very flexible plastics which will tolerate even bold handling. The small rivets in neat rows contribute to the detailed appearance. The missing rivets on the cab and the smoke box can be excused on account of to the low price point: Consultation of old pictures reveal that many things look more like G 3/4 #14, a possibility for a future LGB model.

Identification of the Heidi-Steamer, even without the "red box", as a LGB product is quite easy, simply by the large "golden eyes" of the headlights even on this "Made in China" item - "proven corporate design off the shelf" à la LGB - unfortunate in this case. The smallish kerosene lights of the prototype get transposed as veritable search lights, which as a results make the front of the boiler appear smaller than it is and optically smash the rear side of the cab by making it much wider. The buyer needs to accept that in the customary fashion - or needs to do some detailing. Lights in a more prototypical form are available as spare parts from a manufacturer - check GBp 01/06..... And those who have no problem with the large lights won't find fault with the large taps mounted on the left water tank. These (used for checking the tank water level) should have been considerably smaller and delicate if one improves other detailing.

The G 3/4 isn't to scale since an existing chassis was used, apparently to save money, the likes of which also power the Spreewald. However the driver spacing of the Spreewald is different from the Heidi: the first driver sits too far from the front, the overall driver distance is 15mm too short. The distance between 2nd and 3rd driver is accurate. The lead axle is 12mm too far from the first driver. The answer to the puzzle: the Spreewald chassis was turned by 180° and as a result works now "in reverse". Which shouldn't really matter- but as soon as one lifts the engine one will notice that the engine is tail heavy. Or, as railroaders would put it "the weight distribution is less well executed". One will notice the results during running.

As far as the height and the width the Heidi is the correct 1:22.5 scale, this

despite the undersized wheels. The geometric problems resulting from the chassis have at least optically been bent into place by LGB. The asymmetrical driver spacing is less noticeable - since this is an outside frame engine and the hefty valve and running gear covers plenty. In addition LGB extended the side water tanks towards the front - easily distinguishable by the cutout for the reversing lever. This results in optically acceptable proportions in the cylinder and cab area.

A glance into the cab is advisable. The interior coal bin with the bottom chute is half filled. But the corresponding coal hatch in the rear wall of the cab is missing. Glancing into the cab from the left door with the fire door opened reveals the simulated inferno in the fire box and from the cab roof a nicely dimmed light takes care of the illumination. Included with the engine is an engineer. Top up the smoke fluid - the G 3/4 is ready for a test run. By the way, the smoke generator isn't synchronized to the running gear.

### A fly weight

Running tests quickly show that the relatively light 2-6-0 will quickly arrive at its hauling limit, especially so when running in reverse. Dry track and an easy 3% grade with reasonable radii (R2 or larger) can be handled with the museum train of four 4-wheel coaches or three 3-axle coaches. The prototype was designed to haul 45t on a 4.5% grade at 15 kmh - developing 200hp.

Those who would like to have the LGB "Heidi" with a bit more hauling power will need to do some retrofitting: weights can be added in the front portion of the water tanks and a 5mm plate could be added in the frame above the leading axle. The modeler is allowed to do this, unlike the manufacturer who can no longer add lead to a toy. That's why "Heidi" is such a fly weight at 2.8kg (6.2lbs).

Improvements are also recommended for the power pick-up since only the drivers are used for the purpose. Due to the pick-up base of a scant 100mm the G 3/4 stalled quite often when negotiating a R3 turnout in slow reverse coming through the diverging route. Having a traction tire fitted to the rear most axle, certainly didn't help matters. We recommend to retrofit the lead axle with power pick-ups as shown in GBp 5/2205

page60 on the 99 6001 steamer. This will increase the power pick-up base to 205mm, more than double of the original.

The fitted Onboard decoder in the quietly running engine provided good slow speed performance with four 2-axle coaches. Speed step 1 (of 14) results in slow, smooth running, even on a 3% incline. Speed step 9 results in enough velocity that one best uses CV5 to reset the maximum speed to achieve a wider range of adjustment. Starting without a load appears a bit abrupt. A follow up in the next issue when we fit Heidi with sound will address that feature.

To sum up: With the G3/4 #11 Heidi LGB picked a good prototype as a first RhB steamer: compact and in a price range that will suit many, it will be the basis for a few additional versions. The quality of the LGB "Made in China" items improved considerably during 2005. The detailing has reached a new, but not yet consistent level. Scale conscious model railroaders will not be happy with the appealing engine, since there are too many dimensional errors. The proportions are nonetheless quite pleasing. The money saving use of "off the shelf" parts out of the LGB arsenal was not always an advantage - on the appearance front with the head lights and technically with the reversed Spreewald chassis and the resulting imbalance of the engine.

Later this year LGB will produce Heidi with sound - for those who can't wait that long we'll provide a detailed sound install in the next issue.

*Hans-Joachim Gilbert / HJM*

## Captions

Page 26 Behind the detailed, but rather hefty valve gear and the outside frame hide the undersized wheels. The chassis is the same type as the Spreewald's, turned around by 180°. The side tanks have noticeably been extend in front of the reversing lever cut out, the ones on the prototype are shorter.

Page 27 No engraved builders plate, but instead crisp, clear printing are

found on the Heidi. In view of the improved detailing the traditional LGB headlights are too obtrusive...

Page 28 (top) The "gold-finish" taps on the water tanks are too large. Engine number, builders plate and the customary "RhB" are simply printed - very neatly, but visually not as nice as etched items.

Page 28 (bottom) A gray pressure plate keeps the lead axle solidly on the rails. Clearly visible is the notching in

the brake man's steps to clear the lead axle wheels. Typically Chinese and less than professional is the tacked-on wiring to the head lights.

Page 29 The smoke box door can be opened. The small boiler is flanked by the over-dimensioned head lights.

## LGB G 3/4 #11

### Technical Specifications

Length o.b.:	367mm
Length o.c.:	370mm
Largest width:	114mm
Max height above railhead:	162mm
Minimum radius:	600 mm
Weight Engine:	2.8 kg

Draw Bar Pull: forward 5.5N  
reverse 3.5N

### Pluses and Minuses

↑	Detailed, but sturdy replica
↑	Crisp finish and lettering
↑	Complete with lighting effects
↑	Good value
↓	Incorrect length dimensions due to pre-existing chassis
↓	Too light, incorrect weight balance, low draw bar pull
↓	No power pick-up on lead axle

## Ratings

LGB RhB G 3/4 #11 Heidi item# 20271

Scale: 1:22.5 Gauge: 45mm

Scale:	●●●
Detailing:	●●●●
Paint and Lettering:	●●●●
Running Gear:	●●●●
Current collection:	●●●
Smoke Generator:	●●●●
Production Quality:	●●●●●
Operation Reliability:	●●●●
Instruction Manual:	●●●●
Value (Benefit:Price):	●●●●

Our ratings: ●●●●● is excellent  
● is poor

## Feuilleton

### Scale 1.5 Page 42

InterCitys on narrow gauge track? Three different scales in the same model? Center - oder Standard buffers? Even the forgiving, colourful world of garden railroads has its limits. Now there are two who swim against the current.

When I added the "G- wie Gummi?" titel to Hans-Joerg Mueller's Feuilleton in GBp 6/2003 I had no idea that this would become a well-used phrase amongst many garden railroaders. Hans-Joerg Mueller complained about the "creative compression" which LGB employs to optically equalize their "G" items. And the garden railroaders debated; some for, others against "G".

All the other model railways have a clearly defined scale. Only then will things that belong fit: trains, vehicles, figures, structures and accessories.

"G" isn't a scale, but a nonsensical marketing slogan. For that reason we purposely forego using the "G" logo which

LGB promotes. "G" suggests that everything fits together.

But the opposite is true: "G" is a collection of different prototype track gauges, scales and themes which only have the 45mm track gauge as a common factor. Couplers and DCC-interfaces still resist a common standard. "G" confuses the consumer. "G" is and remains "Gummi" (rubber), "G scale trains" remain Gummi-Trains.

LGB delivered proof with the American standard gauge models (Mikado, F7) that it is possible to "trim" the appearance of a standard gauge item in such a way as to make it fit on narrow gauge track. Compress a little here, stretch the height a bit, squeeze the width a tad - bingo, it fits. Even if the scales are anywhere between 1:25 and 1:27, distinct for each dimension.

The Americans also adapted the "anything goes" doctrine and invented

the "almost" scale of 1:29, in order for the LGB freight cars to fit. 1:32 - the proper scale for 45mm track gauge - would have been "too small". But at least they use one defined scale for the different dimensions.

LGB continues the experiment in Germany with the DB-101 engine, attempting to reach an even wider circle of consumers with yet a new mix of scales - a half-hearted effort that bounces back and forth between model and approximation. Starter sets would have been simpler and cheaper.

Lehmann has probably good reasons to build standard gauge items: the younger generation lacks the familiarity with narrow gauge trains, they are more interested in the modern railroads. That is good for the survival of our hobby. But railroad romanticism and low tech from yesteryear are seldom of interest to young people.

The model railroader on the other

hand has a few questions when Lehmann fits standard gauge trains to narrow gauge tracks. Why wouldn't one use the proper 1:32 scale, which, decades before LGB made the scene, had been defined as Gauge I? Is Lehmann really of the opinion that the new IC coaches have to go with the Spreewald steamer, that the 101 should be pulling metamorphosed RhB cars, perhaps even with center buffers? Unfortunately, yes.

The pity is that many of the customers - especially the toy-train crowd - have little knowledge of the variety of scales and gauges. They are simply not interested, since the trains are a toy, which is supposed to be fun. Accepted...

Model railroaders on the other hand lay claim to building a model of the prototype. Trains and accessories are to the largest extent to scale.

PIKO had the right idea to produce the standard gauge Taurus. But less fortunate is following the wrong track - even if it is understandable that a newcomer will follow the market leader. This despite the fact that no medium sized corporation - not even LGB - is in the position to put its

mark on the global market. But PIKO uses a more specific route to address the toy-train consumer than the Nürnbergers do - they had great success with entry level offerings in other scales. For this new standard gauge segment a new quasi scale has been created: in future we shall refer to it as 1.5.

Why 1.5? It is neither Gauge I nor Gauge II. We invented the new "Scale" to channel the topsy-turfy "G" at least in some fashion. "1.5" stands for standard gauge on narrow gauge tracks, for inflated Gauge 1 models on 2m tracks. When in future (starting with the next issue) we mention 1.5 you will know that the scale is approximately 1:25 through 1:27 and will fit in some fashion. "G" doesn't tell you anything.

The new scale won't be a cure. Even the toy-train crowd will have to contend with this switchset to "Diverging". There are as yet no accessories. Or do you know of structures, figures, vehicles and accessories in 1:27? The toy-train crowd, but especially the model railroader, will have just rolling stock in this new scale.

The target group of the forgoing toy-

train fans is simply too small. Lehmann and PIKO need the N and HO scalers, those who together with reading glasses discover Large Scale. Model railroaders are accustomed to scales - and an immense selection of accessories. Those of the Gauge I crowd who will be looking to Nürnberg and Sonneberg to acquire less expensive items, will pass on trains which are not 1:32 and have curiously manipulated proportions. More so since most of the Gauge I crowd is very scale conscious. To win them as a target group will be very difficult, if not impossible. Which leaves the price as the only valid selling feature. Lehmann has a problem since PIKO brought down the hammer: Price squeeze on the one side and product resistance on the other. One sits in a tight spot which could turn out a trap.

Lehmann's marketing strategy along with the high price of the products for the toy-train fans reduces its number of potential 1.5 buyers. But the train has already left the station.

*Friedhelm Weidelich / HJM*